



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	BARTLESVILLE, OK	Accident Number:	FTW96FA234B
Date & Time:	06/01/1996, 1412 CDT	Registration:	N12428
Aircraft:	Waco QCF	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 Fatal
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Analysis

Both the Fairchild KR-31, N7780, and the Waco QCF, N12428, were occupied by a PIC and a pilot-rated passenger. Witnesses observed both biplanes collide at the downwind/base position and descend uncontrolled to the ground. Left wing portions from each biplane were found at the initial impact site. The lower left wing outboard section of the Waco was found between the left wings of the Fairchild. The Fairchild did not have an electrical system. The Waco was equipped with navigation lights and an electrical system; however, the type and status of avionics equipment could not be determined due to the postimpact fire damage. A light gun was available in the temporary control tower; however, it was not being used at the time of the collision, and neither biplane was in communication with the tower in Class D airspace. An ATC letter to the airport indicated that ATC would separate arriving and departing traffic, with ground movement by airport management, operators and pilots, with safety items/factors brought to the attention of ATC prior to the operation of the tower. The biplane association and the airport representatives stated that the tower was a 'control tower' and applicable control airspace procedures were expected by ATC and the pilots. Neither the NBA nor the airport had established rigid communication, routing and altitude procedures for the fly-by period, and pilot briefings were not conducted. In tension with the Federal Aviation Act of 1958, the Federal Aviation Administration did not offer and/or provide the NBA and airport authorities with clearly delineated insight and guidance that fostered the safest use of the airspace during the fly-in.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The failure of each pilot-in-command to maintain visual lookout. Factors were: the lack of each pilot-in-command obtaining/maintaining communication with the control tower, and inadequate lookout by each pilot-rated passenger, the inadequate procedures/directives by the biplane association management and the airport management, and inadequate supervision by the Federal Aviation Administration.

Findings

Occurrence #1: MIDAIR COLLISION

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - BASE TURN

Findings

1. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. (C) VISUAL LOOKOUT - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
3. (F) VISUAL LOOKOUT - INADEQUATE - PILOT PASSENGER
4. (F) COMMUNICATIONS - NOT OBTAINED/MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
5. (F) COMMUNICATIONS - NOT OBTAINED/MAINTAINED - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
6. (F) SUPERVISION - INADEQUATE - FAA(OTHER/ORGANIZATION)
7. (F) CONDITION(S)/STEP(S) INSUFFICIENTLY DEFINED - FAA(OTHER/ORGANIZATION)
8. (F) PROCEDURES/DIRECTIVES - INADEQUATE - COMPANY/OPERATOR MANAGEMENT

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Factual Information

SEE NARRATIVE FOR FTW96FA234A.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	51, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Rear
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	06/20/1994
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	5000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 100 hours (Total, this make and model)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Waco	Registration:	N12428
Model/Series:	QCF QCF	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	3569
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	Unknown	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:		Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:		Engine Model/Series:	W670
Registered Owner:	JOHN D. HALTERMAN	Rated Power:	220 hp
Operator:	JOHN D. HALTERMAN	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	BVO, 713 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1346 CST	Direction from Accident Site:	0°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 2000 ft agl	Visibility	15 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 25000 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	7 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	340°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	23° C / 16° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	(BVO)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1300 CST	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	BARTLESVILLE MUNICIPAL (BVO)	Runway Surface Type:	Concrete
Airport Elevation:	713 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	35	IFR Approach:	
Runway Length/Width:	6200 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	None

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	On-Ground
Total Injuries:	2 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	JOYCE M SMITH	Report Date:	02/02/1998
Additional Participating Persons:			
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident docket serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at pubinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).