



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	LAKEVILLE, MN	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CHI92LA036A
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	12/01/1991, 1520 CST	<b>Registration:</b>	N2072T
<b>Aircraft:</b>	PIPER PA28R-200	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	3 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General Aviation -		

---

## Analysis

THE PILOT OF A LOW WING, SINGLE ENGINE, AIRPLANE WAS TAKING A FLIGHT TEST FOR A COMMERCIAL PILOT CERTIFICATE. THE PILOT STATED HE ANNOUNCED HIS POSITION ON EACH LEG OF THE TRAFFIC PATTERN; THIS WAS CONFIRMED BY THE PILOT EXAMINER. DURING THE FLARE FOR LANDING THE AIRPLANE LANDED ON TOP OF A HIGH WING, SINGLE ENGINE, AIRPLANE. BOTH OCCUPANTS OF THE LOW WING AIRPLANE STATED THAT THEY DID NOT SEE OR HEAR RADIO CALLS FROM THE HIGH WING AIRPLANE. THE ON SCENE INVESTIGATION FOUND THAT BOTH AIRPLANES WERE WHITE IN OVERALL COLOR WITH DARK TRIM. THE TERRAIN THEY WERE OPERATING OVER WAS SOW COVERED. THE HIGH WING AIRPLANE TO THE RUNWAY THE LOW WING AIRPLANE WAS INTENDING TO LAND ON.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: THE FACT THAT BOTH PILOTS DID NOT MAINTAIN VISUAL SEPARATION FROM EACH OTHER. CONTRIBUTING FACTORS TO THIS ACCIDENT WERE AN INADEQUATE VISUAL LOOKOUT FOR BOTH PILOTS AND THE PILOT IN COMMAND OF THE OTHER AIRPLANE WAS NOT FOLLOWING PROCEDURES AND DIRECTIVES.

## Findings

---

Occurrence #1: MIDAIR COLLISION

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

Findings

1. TERRAIN CONDITION - SNOW COVERED
2. (F) VISUAL LOOKOUT - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
3. (F) VISUAL LOOKOUT - INADEQUATE - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
4. (C) VISUAL SEPARATION - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
5. (C) VISUAL SEPARATION - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT
6. (F) PROCEDURES/DIRECTIVES - NOT FOLLOWED - PILOT OF OTHER AIRCRAFT

-----

Occurrence #2: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT

Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

-----

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Findings

7. TERRAIN CONDITION - RUNWAY

## Factual Information

### Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Private	<b>Age:</b>	26, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine Land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Unknown
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	Yes
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 2 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim.	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	10/01/1991
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>		<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>	
<b>Flight Time:</b>	410 hours (Total, all aircraft), 16 hours (Total, this make and model)		

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

<b>Aircraft Make:</b>	PIPER	<b>Registration:</b>	N2072T
<b>Model/Series:</b>	PA28R-200 PA28R-200	<b>Aircraft Category:</b>	Airplane
<b>Year of Manufacture:</b>		<b>Amateur Built:</b>	No
<b>Airworthiness Certificate:</b>		<b>Serial Number:</b>	28R-7135016
<b>Landing Gear Type:</b>	Retractable - Tricycle	<b>Seats:</b>	4
<b>Date/Type of Last Inspection:</b>	Unknown	<b>Certified Max Gross Wt.:</b>	2600 lbs
<b>Time Since Last Inspection:</b>	0 Hours	<b>Engines:</b>	1 Reciprocating
<b>Airframe Total Time:</b>		<b>Engine Manufacturer:</b>	LYCOMING
<b>ELT:</b>	Installed, not activated	<b>Engine Model/Series:</b>	I0-360-C1C
<b>Registered Owner:</b>	RICHARD N. JURGINE	<b>Rated Power:</b>	100 hp
<b>Operator:</b>	RICHARD N. JURGINE	<b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b>	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MSP, 840 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	15 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1451 CST	Direction from Accident Site:	360°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear / 0 ft agl	Visibility	20 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	None / 0 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	17 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	290°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:		Temperature/Dew Point:	
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:		Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1415 CST	Type of Airspace:	

## Airport Information

Airport:	AIR LAKES (Y12)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	960 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Ice
Runway Used:	29	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4098 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Touch and Go

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 None	Latitude, Longitude:	

## Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Frank S Gattolin	Report Date:	01/22/1993
Additional Participating Persons:	WILLIAM BERG; MINNEAPOLIS, MN		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at <a href="mailto:pubinq@ntsb.gov">pubinq@ntsb.gov</a> , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at <a href="http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/">http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/</a> .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).