



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	MIDLAND, MI	Accident Number:	CHI99LA354
Date & Time:	09/01/1999, 2000 EDT	Registration:	N1316Q
Aircraft:	Cessna 150L	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Instructional

Analysis

The student pilot was on his first solo flight. His first takeoff, and traffic pattern went well. The student pilot said that his instructor told him to proceed with another takeoff and landing. On final approach, the student pilot said that he thought he was going to land short of the runway. He attempted a go around, but 'applied too much left rudder, thereby heading to the grassy area between the runway and the taxiway. The nose wheel hit the ground and [the airplane] skidded to a stop.' Examination of the airplane revealed no anomalies.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the student pilot's failure to maintain control of the airplane during an attempted go-around.

Findings

Occurrence #1: HARD LANDING
Phase of Operation: GO-AROUND (VFR)

Findings

1. (C) AIRCRAFT CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
2. GO-AROUND - ATTEMPTED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Factual Information

On September 1, 1999, at 2000 eastern daylight time (edt), a Cessna 150L, N1316Q, operated by a solo student pilot sustained substantial damage when during landing the airplane struck the ground hard and came to a stop 100 feet left of runway 24 (3800' X 75', ASPH) at the Jack Barstow Airport, Midland, Michigan. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The instructional supervised solo flight was being conducted under 14 CFR Part 91. No flight plan was on file. The student pilot reported no injuries. The local flight originated at Midland, Michigan, at 1950 edt.

In his written statement, the student pilot said that he was on his first solo flight. His first takeoff, traffic and pattern went well. The student pilot said that his instructor told him to proceed with another takeoff and landing. On final approach, the student pilot said that he thought he was going to land short of the runway. He attempted a go-around, but "applied too much left rudder, thereby heading to the grassy area between the runway and the taxiway. The nose wheel hit the ground and [the airplane] skidded to a stop."

A Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector examined the airplane at the Jack Barstow Airport. The firewall, nose wheel and engine mount were bent upward. The rear window was broken out. The left wingtip was broken aft. The left wing rear spar was bent downward. Flight control continuity was confirmed. No anomalies were revealed with the engine, engine controls, or other airplane systems.

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Student	Age:	54, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	08/05/1999
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	24 hours (Total, all aircraft), 24 hours (Total, this make and model), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N1316Q
Model/Series:	150L 150L	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	15072616
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	08/18/1999, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	50 Hours	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	8095 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	O-200
Registered Owner:	STEPHENS AVIATION SERVICES	Rated Power:	100 hp
Operator:	STEPHENS AVIATION SERVICES	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	MBS, 668 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	12 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	2053 EDT	Direction from Accident Site:	140°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Scattered / 17000 ft agl	Visibility	10 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 23000 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	/	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:		Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	17°C / 13°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	(3BS)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:		Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1950 EDT	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	MIDLAND JACK BARSTOW (3BS)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	638 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	24	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3800 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Go Around; Traffic Pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	DAVID C BOWLING	Report Date:	06/21/2000
Additional Participating Persons:	WOODY BEST; GRAND RAPIDS, MI		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at pubinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).