



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	KNOX, IN	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CHI00LA068
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	02/03/2000, 1405 EST	<b>Registration:</b>	N1489L
<b>Aircraft:</b>	Beech A23	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>		<b>Injuries:</b>	2 None

**Flight Conducted Under:** Part 91: General Aviation - Instructional

---

## Analysis

The accident airplane impacted a snowbank during a landing at Starke County Airport. The pilots were uninjured. The instructor stated that the airplane taxied through slushy snow and departed Porter County Municipal Airport {VPZ}. He said the student performed two go arounds. On the third attempt, the aircraft settled onto the runway the aircraft and pulled to the right. The instructor took the controls and added full power. The instructor said that the 'right tire went into snow bank along side of runway and pulled aircraft off of runway, skidding side ways and collapsing nose wheel. After departing aircraft I checked runway and found a single skid tiremark on runway, about 20 feet long. My assumption is that the slush during taxi at VPZ froze the tire up and caused us to be pulled off runway on landing at Stark County Airport.' The student stated, 'Upon my flare I drifted slightly right of center line and sat the plane down. It immediately pulled to the right.' The airplane was moved prior to an on-scene examination. The examination did not reveal any anomalies.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the instructor pilot not performing remedial action on the student's right drift during the flare. Factors were the student not maintaining directional control, the student not maintaining proper centerline alignment, and the snowbank.

## Findings

---

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF CONTROL - IN FLIGHT  
Phase of Operation: LANDING - FLARE/TOUCHDOWN

### Findings

1. (F) DIRECTIONAL CONTROL - NOT MAINTAINED - DUAL STUDENT
  2. (F) PROPER ALIGNMENT - NOT MAINTAINED - DUAL STUDENT
  3. (C) REMEDIAL ACTION - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND(CFI)
- 

Occurrence #2: ON GROUND/WATER ENCOUNTER WITH TERRAIN/WATER  
Phase of Operation: LANDING - ROLL

### Findings

4. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - SNOWBANK

## Factual Information

On February 3, 2000, at 1405 eastern standard time, a Beech A23, N1489L, sustained substantial damage on impact with a snowbank during a landing on runway 36 (4,400 feet X 75 feet, dry/asphalt) at Starke County Airport, near Knox, Indiana (OXI). The flight was being conducted as a 14 CFR Part 91 instructional flight, in visual meteorological conditions, with a student pilot and certified flight instructor on board. The pilots sustained no injuries. The flight originated from Porter County Municipal Airport, Valparaiso, Indiana (VPZ) at 1220 central standard time and was landing at OXI at the time of the accident.

The instructor stated, "While taxiing to active runway we went through slushy snow area not cleared by airport personnel. We departed VPZ [and] stayed in pattern and performed a go-around on 27. Departed VPZ for OXI to perform x wind landings so that student could solo at VPZ. Student performed two go-around and on third attempt had every thing lined up for a good landing. As the aircraft settled onto the runway the aircraft pulled to the right. I grabbed controls, added full power. Right tire went into snow bank along side of runway and pulled aircraft off of runway, skidding side ways and collapsing nose wheel. After departing aircraft I checked runway and found a single skid tiremark on runway, about 20 feet long. My assumption is that the slush during taxi at VPZ froze the tire up and caused us to be pulled off runway on landing at Stark County Airport."

The student stated, "Upon my flare I drifted slightly right of center line and sat the plane down. It immediately pulled to the right."

The airplane was moved prior to a Federal Aviation Administration examination. The examination did not reveal any anomalies.

## Pilot Information

<b>Certificate:</b>	Flight Instructor; Commercial	<b>Age:</b>	62, Male
<b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>	Single-engine Land	<b>Seat Occupied:</b>	Right
<b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b>	None	<b>Restraint Used:</b>	Seatbelt
<b>Instrument Rating(s):</b>	Airplane	<b>Second Pilot Present:</b>	Yes
<b>Instructor Rating(s):</b>	Instrument Airplane	<b>Toxicology Performed:</b>	No
<b>Medical Certification:</b>	Class 2 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim.	<b>Last FAA Medical Exam:</b>	02/17/1999
<b>Occupational Pilot:</b>	<b>Last Flight Review or Equivalent:</b>		
<b>Flight Time:</b>	3000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 28 hours (Total, this make and model), 2900 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 125 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 30 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Beech	Registration:	N1489L
Model/Series:	A23 A23	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	M889
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	10/12/1999, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	3600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	12 Hours	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	3438 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	I0346
Registered Owner:	CHARLES A. WHITE ET AL	Rated Power:	165 hp
Operator:	CHARLES A. WHITE ET AL	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	VPZ, 771 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	18 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1300 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	296°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown / 0 ft agl	Visibility	9 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 4200 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	13 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	250°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	3° C / -2° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	VALPARAISO, IN (VPZ)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	(OXI)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1220 CST	Type of Airspace:	Class G

## Airport Information

Airport:	STARKE COUNTY AIRPORT (OXI)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	684 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	36	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	4400 ft / 75 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop; Traffic Pattern

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	

## Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	EDWARD F MALINOWSKI	Report Date:	03/09/2001
Additional Participating Persons:	DONALD D HALES; SOUTH BEND, IN		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at <a href="mailto:pubinq@ntsb.gov">pubinq@ntsb.gov</a> , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at <a href="http://dms.ntsbt.gov/pubdms/">http://dms.ntsbt.gov/pubdms/</a> .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).