



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Data Summary

|                                |                                      |                         |                             |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <b>Location:</b>               | MANITOWISH WATR, WI                  | <b>Accident Number:</b> | CHI00FA284                  |
| <b>Date &amp; Time:</b>        | 09/01/2000, 2210 CDT                 | <b>Registration:</b>    | N3076C                      |
| <b>Aircraft:</b>               | Beech K35                            | <b>Injuries:</b>        | 2 Fatal, 2 Serious, 1 Minor |
| <b>Flight Conducted Under:</b> | Part 91: General Aviation - Personal |                         |                             |

## Analysis

The airplane was destroyed on impact with trees and terrain during an approach. The pilot and one passenger were fatally injured. The flight originated on an IFR clearance to VFR conditions on top. The flight acknowledged radar termination but continued to squawk 0106. A witness heard a crash about 2210 and said the ceiling was low and overcast. A front passenger stated she thought the pilot was performing an IFR approach and it was a normal approach. She said that she saw the runway lights. She stated that she remembers hitting something and the pilot saying, "OH NO, OH NO." She said that the pilot was using the emap GPS. A rear seat passenger was interviewed. He stated that during the flight from GRB to D25, the airplane was flying above clouds. He said that he saw runway lights, heard a rumbling or growling sound, like "RRRRRahRRRRRahRRRRR." He and another rear seat passenger both stated that the pilot said, "It's not working, it's not working." He said that the sound occurred about 300 feet or about a minute prior to hitting. The front passenger said that she was not aware of the pilot's conversation that the rear seat passengers heard. The sky condition was 400 feet overcast. The airport's NDB and GPS approach landing minima weather section listed 700 [feet ceiling]-1 [statute mile visibility] and 500-1 respectively. A clearance was not issued to the flight to perform an approach. The ADF's switch was found in the off position. The fuel selector's sump valve, spring, and screen were found coated with a brown colored media. Control continuity was established to all flight surfaces. Control continuity was established to the engine. A Garmin emap handheld GPS was found near the wreckage. A handheld radio, marked, JD-200, was found near the wreckage. A spray can, marked "HEET Starting Fluid", was found in the wreckage. The FAA CAMI report stated CHLORPHENIRAMINE and ACETAMINOPHEN were detected. The engine was test run and it produced full power. A radio shop witness said that the airplane's installed radio and GPS were inoperative.

## Probable Cause

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: the pilot not maintaining altitude/clearance from the trees during an approach on a dark, low overcast night, the pilot's improper use of an IFR procedure without clearance, and the pilot's improper in-flight decision to attempt an IFR approach without clearance. Factors were the local weather being below published minimums, the trees, and the dark night.

## Findings

Occurrence #1: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT  
Phase of Operation: APPROACH

Findings

1. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)
  2. OPERATION WITH KNOWN DEFICIENCIES IN EQUIPMENT - CONTINUED - PILOT IN COMMAND
  3. (F) WEATHER CONDITION - BELOW APPROACH/LANDING MINIMUMS
  4. (C) IFR PROCEDURE - IMPROPER USE OF - PILOT IN COMMAND
  5. (F) LIGHT CONDITION - DARK NIGHT
  6. (C) ALTITUDE/CLEARANCE - NOT MAINTAINED - PILOT IN COMMAND
  7. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND
- 

Occurrence #2: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER  
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

### Pilot Information

|                                  |                                  |                              |          |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|----------|
| <b>Certificate:</b>              | Private                          | <b>Age:</b>                  | 36       |
| <b>Airplane Rating(s):</b>       | Single-engine Land               | <b>Instrument Rating(s):</b> | Airplane |
| <b>Other Aircraft Rating(s):</b> | None                             | <b>Instructor Rating(s):</b> | None     |
| <b>Flight Time:</b>              | 1300 hours (Total, all aircraft) |                              |          |

### Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

|                                       |                                      |                             |                 |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|
| <b>Aircraft Make:</b>                 | Beech                                | <b>Registration:</b>        | N3076C          |
| <b>Model/Series:</b>                  | K35 K35                              | <b>Engines:</b>             | 1 Reciprocating |
| <b>Operator:</b>                      | KEVIN M. PENNIMAN                    | <b>Engine Manufacturer:</b> | Lycoming        |
| <b>Operating Certificate(s) Held:</b> | None                                 | <b>Engine Model/Series:</b> | IO-540-K1A5     |
| <b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>        | Part 91: General Aviation - Personal |                             |                 |

### Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

|   |                       |                                     |                              |
|---|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| <b>Conditions at Accident Site:</b>     | Instrument Conditions | <b>Condition of Light:</b>          | Night/Dark                   |
| <b>Observation Facility, Elevation:</b> | ARV, 1630 ft msl      | <b>Weather Information Source:</b>  | Weather Observation Facility |
| <b>Lowest Ceiling:</b>                  | Overcast / 400 ft agl | <b>Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:</b> | 3 knots / , 40°              |
| <b>Temperature:</b>                     | 57° C                 | <b>Visibility</b>                   | 10 Miles                     |
| <b>Precipitation and Obscuration:</b>   |                       |                                     |                              |
| <b>Departure Point:</b>                 | GREEN BAY, WI (GRB)   | <b>Destination:</b>                 | (D25)                        |

### Airport Information

|                             |                                 |                                  |         |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------|
| <b>Airport:</b>             | MANITOWISH WATERS AIRPORT (D25) | <b>Runway Surface Type:</b>      | Asphalt |
| <b>Runway Used:</b>         | 32                              | <b>Runway Surface Condition:</b> | Wet     |
| <b>Runway Length/Width:</b> | 3500 ft / 60 ft                 |                                  |         |

## Wreckage and Impact Information

|                      |                             |                     |           |
|----------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|-----------|
| Crew Injuries:       | 1 Fatal                     | Aircraft Damage:    | Destroyed |
| Passenger Injuries:  | 1 Fatal, 2 Serious, 1 Minor | Aircraft Fire:      | None      |
| Ground Injuries:     | N/A                         | Aircraft Explosion: | None      |
| Latitude, Longitude: |                             |                     |           |

## Administrative Information

|                               |  |               |            |
|-------------------------------|--|---------------|------------|
| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | EDWARD F MALINOWSKI  | Adopted Date: | 01/02/2002 |
| Investigation Docket:         | NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at <a href="mailto:pubinq@ntsb.gov">pubinq@ntsb.gov</a> , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at <a href="http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/">http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/</a> . |               |            |

---

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.