



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	Pontiac, MI	Accident Number:	CHI04LA039
Date & Time:	12/03/2003, 1033 EST	Registration:	N65455
Aircraft:	Cessna 152	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Instructional

Analysis

The airplane impacted trees and terrain during a forced landing following a loss of engine power while on final approach. The certified flight instructor (CFI) reported that the airplane did not have enough altitude at the time of the loss of engine power to land on the runway and he performed a forced landing to a small field. No pre-impact anomalies were found with the airplane's fuel system, including the fuel tanks, lines, and selector valve during a post-accident examination. The gascolator and carburetor were void of fuel when examined at the accident site. No fuel was recovered from the ruptured left fuel tank or the apparently undamaged right fuel tank. There was no noticeable fuel smell or evidence of a fuel spill at the accident site. The vegetation around the main wreckage was not blighted when examined a day after the accident. No anomalies were found with the engine that would have prevented its operation. The CFI reported that prior to the flight he and his student both visually ascertained the airplane's fuel quantity. He reported that both fuel tanks were half full (13 total gallons), which correlated with the indications displayed on the cockpit fuel quantity gauges. The CFI provided documentation that substantiated the fuel quantity aboard the airplane prior to its last departure. The CFI stated that after the accident his dual-student was partially trapped under the left side of the airplane and "a steady stream of fuel was pouring on his left side." Emergency room documentation confirmed that the dual-student had suffered chemical burns on his left shoulder, chest and back. In the event the airplane departed with 13 gallons of fuel, there should have been sufficient fuel for the approximately 1/2 hour accident flight. The airport temperature and dew point would produce the likelihood of light carburetor icing accumulation during cruise and/or descent engine power settings.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The loss of engine power for undetermined reasons. A factor to the accident was the tree line and the unsuitable terrain.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER

Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

Findings

1. (C) REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

2. (F) OBJECT - TREE(S)

Occurrence #4: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Findings

3. (C) UNSUITABLE TERRAIN OR TAKEOFF/LANDING/TAXI AREA - ENCOUNTERED - PILOT IN COMMAND

Factual Information

On December 3, 2003, at 1033 eastern standard time, a Cessna 152, N65455, piloted by a certified flight instructor (CFI), sustained substantial damage during an in-flight collision with trees and terrain while performing a forced landing near Pontiac, Michigan. The CFI reported a loss of engine power while on a 3 mile final for runway 27L at Oakland Pontiac International Airport (PTK). Visual meteorological conditions prevailed at the time of the accident. The instructional flight was operating under the provisions of 14 CFR Part 91 without a flight plan. The CFI was not injured and his dual-student was seriously injured. The flight departed Macomb Airport (57D), New Haven, Michigan, at 1018.

According to an interview with the CFI and his written statement, the purpose of the flight was to practice takeoffs and landings at a tower-controlled airport. The CFI reported that prior to the flight he and his student both visually ascertained the airplane's fuel quantity. He reported that both fuel tanks were half full (13 total gallons or 11.5 usable gallons), which correlated with the indications displayed on the cockpit fuel quantity gauges. He stated that the engine run-up and systems checks were normal prior to the takeoff from 57D. The CFI reported they climbed to 3,000 feet mean sea level (msl) prior to setting cruise engine power and leaning the fuel mixture. He stated they contacted PTK tower approximately 8 miles from the airport and the tower controller instructed them to report a 3 mile final for runway 27R. Approximately 5 miles from the airport, the student enriched the mixture to full rich and reduced engine power to initiate a descent to 2,000 feet msl. The CFI stated that while they were on a 3 1/2 mile final for the runway the tower controller issued new approach instructions for runway 27L. The CFI acknowledged the runway change and he was subsequently cleared to land.

The CFI reported that shortly after he received the landing clearance, at approximately 1,100 feet above ground level (agl), the airplane experienced a loss of engine power. He immediately took aircraft control from his student and advanced the throttle. The CFI reported the engine "appeared to surge and lose power from 2,000 to 1,000 rpm." He informed the tower controller of the engine power loss and continued for the runway. The CFI established best glide airspeed and verified the fuel selector position. He additionally verified the mixture control was full rich, the throttle control was full forward, the magneto switch was on both, and the primer was secured. The engine did not respond to the completed emergency checklist items. The CFI stated that the airplane was approximately 800 feet agl after he completed the checklist items and that he did not have sufficient altitude to land on the runway. He elected to perform an off-airport landing in a small field positioned approximately 1/2 mile east of the airport. The CFI stated that prior to the landing he moved the mixture control to idle cut-off position. The airplane impacted a tree line that bordered the field in which the forced landing was made. The airplane came to rest inverted, resting on its left side.

The CFI stated he unbuckled his safety belt/harness and extracted himself from the wreckage. His student was partially trapped under the left side of the airplane and "a steady stream of fuel was pouring on his left side." The CFI stated that the local police and fire departments were on-site within a couple of minutes and performed the extraction of the student pilot.

Inspectors from the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and an investigator from Cessna Aircraft Company performed an on-site investigation. According to the inspectors, there was no noticeable fuel smell or evidence of a fuel spill at the accident site. The vegetation around the main wreckage was not blighted when examined a day after the accident.

The left fuel tank was found ruptured and no fuel was recovered and/or quantified. The right fuel tank had no apparent damage and no fuel was recovered and/or quantified. The fuel system was examined. The fuel lines were not contaminated and no obstructions were noted when air was blown throughout the system. Both fuel tanks had vented filler caps. The right cap was loose when in the locked position. No anomalies were noted with the left cap. The gascolator and carburetor were void of fuel when examined at the accident site.

The engine remained attached to the airframe and the propeller remained attached to the engine. Engine crankshaft and valve train continuity was established by rotating the propeller by hand. Air was drawn into and expelled out of all cylinders as the crankshaft was rotated. Both magnetos produced a spark on the upper spark plug lead wires while the engine crankshaft was rotated. There was evidence of a fuel leak on the number one cylinder induction tube. There was fuel staining noted on the exterior of the carburetor, the engine oil sump, and nose landing gear. The electrode and insulator of the upper sparkplug from the number one cylinder was stained a blue color. The remaining upper spark plug electrodes and insulators were light gray/brown in color.

The CFI provided flight logbook entries, fuelling records, and aircraft utilization records that substantiated the fuel quantity aboard the airplane prior to its last departure.

Emergency room documentation confirmed the dual-student had suffered chemical burns on his left shoulder, chest and back.

The airport temperature (-01 degrees Celsius) and dew point (-08 degrees Celsius) would produce the likelihood of light carburetor icing accumulation during cruise and/or descent engine power settings, according to a carburetor icing probability chart developed by Transport Canada.

According to the 1978 Cessna 152 pilot operating handbook (POH), the average fuel burn at cruise engine power is 5-6 gallons/hour at 3,000 feet pressure altitude.

Flight Instructor Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	23, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	07/22/2003
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	04/30/2003
Flight Time:	325 hours (Total, all aircraft), 22 hours (Total, this make and model), 246 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 27 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 18 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Student Pilot Information

Certificate:	Student	Age:	28, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	None	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	11/11/2003
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	13 hours (Total, all aircraft), 13 hours (Total, this make and model), 1 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 0 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	Cessna	Registration:	N65455
Model/Series:	152	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Utility	Serial Number:	15281562
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	10/09/2003, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	1670 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	47.3 Hours	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	7907.1 Hours at time of accident	Engine Manufacturer:	Lycoming
ELT:	Installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident	Engine Model/Series:	O-235-L2C
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	110 hp
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	PTK, 980 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	1 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1053 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	90°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	10 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 25000 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	5 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	200°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	30.56 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	-1° C / -8° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	New Haven, MI (57D)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Pontiac, MI (PTK)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	1018 EST	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	Oakland County International (PTK)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	980 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	27L	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	6200 ft / 150 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced Landing; Straight-in

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	42.665278, -83.418611

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Andrew T Fox	Report Date:	07/29/2004
Additional Participating Persons:	Serge Cote; Federal Aviation Administration - Detroit FSDO; Belleville, MI Robert August; Cessna Aircraft Company; Wichita, KS		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at pubinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).