



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	Nogales, AZ	Accident Number:	WPR10CA086
Date & Time:	12/03/2009, 1100 MST	Registration:	N2085T
Aircraft:	PIPER PA-28R-200	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Hard landing	Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Instructional		

Analysis

The flight instructor said that he was giving an end-of-course stage check to the private licensed student, who was taking a commercial pilot course. The instructor said that the flight was normal and upon returning to the airport he requested to see a short-field landing. They landed in a nose-high attitude and there was "only a slight bump" when the aircraft's main wheels touched down. Two more landings were performed by the student, which completed the stage check. Four hours later the flight instructor took the same student out for another lesson. The airplane had not been flown during this 4-hour period. During the airplane's preflight examination, he found a large crack in the left wing's surface immediately above the landing gear attachment point. The flight instructor stated that the student did not make any hard landings during the first flight of the day. The student stated that she did not remember anything unusual about the flight.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The student's improper landing flare and the flight instructor's inadequate remedial action.

Findings

Aircraft	Landing flare - Not attained/maintained (Cause)
Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Student pilot (Cause)
	Lack of action - Instructor/check pilot (Cause)

Factual Information

History of Flight

Landing-flare/touchdown	Hard landing (Defining event)
-------------------------	-------------------------------

Flight Instructor Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	30, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 Without Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	12/10/2009
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	05/28/2009
Flight Time:	2000 hours (Total, all aircraft), 470 hours (Total, this make and model), 1950 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 203 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 49 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 6 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	18, Female
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Without Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	04/20/2009
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	10/10/2009
Flight Time:	229 hours (Total, all aircraft), 38 hours (Total, this make and model), 128 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 97 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 20 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 3 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Manufacturer:	PIPER	Registration:	N2085T
Model/Series:	PA-28R-200	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	28R-7135029
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	10/16/2009, 100 Hour	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2600 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5003 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360 SER
Registered Owner:	CHARLES E PERRY	Rated Power:	180 hp
Operator:	Tiffin Aviation Service	Air Carrier Operating Certificate:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Observation Facility, Elevation:	OLS, 3955 ft msl	Observation Time:	1054 MST
Distance from Accident Site:		Condition of Light:	Day
Direction from Accident Site:		Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Temperature/Dew Point:	14° C / -2° C
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility	10 Miles
Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	Calm	Visibility (RVR):	
Altimeter Setting:	29.99 inches Hg	Visibility (RVV):	
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	Nogales, AZ (OLS)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Nogales, AZ (OLS)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1000 MST	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	Nogales International (OLS)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	3955 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	21	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	7199 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Unknown

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None		

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	James F Struhsaker	Adopted Date:	03/23/2010
Additional Participating Persons:	Mirlo Ochoa; FAA FSDO; Scottsdale, AZ		
Publish Date:	03/23/2010		
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.		
Investigation Docket:	http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=75181		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.