



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Data Summary

Location:	Charlevoix, MI	Accident Number:	CEN11FA417
Date & Time:	06/24/2011, 1935 EDT	Registration:	N88MN
Aircraft:	BEECH A36	Injuries:	2 Fatal, 1 Serious
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Analysis

Witnesses observed the airplane exiting the low cloud ceiling halfway down the runway during an instrument approach. The cloud ceiling was about 200 feet above ground level (agl). The pilot did not execute the published missed approach procedure. Instead, he maneuvered the airplane in the vicinity of the airport at a low altitude and entered the right downwind leg of the traffic pattern for the runway. Witnesses observed the airplane turn to the right toward the runway, pitch nose up, bank to the left, stall, and enter an uncontrolled descent. A postaccident examination of the airframe and engine revealed no evidence of any preimpact failure or malfunction. The circling approach weather minimums were a 700-foot agl ceiling and 1 mile visibility. Based on the witness reports and examination of the impact damage, it is likely the pilot inadvertently stalled the airplane at a low altitude during the downwind-to-base turn.

Flight Events

Maneuvering-low-alt flying - Aerodynamic stall/spin
Uncontrolled descent - Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

Probable Cause

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's inadequate airspeed while maneuvering at low altitude, which resulted in an aerodynamic stall. Contributing to the accident was the pilot's decision to not execute a missed approach in weather conditions below minimums.

Findings

Aircraft-Aircraft oper/perf/capability-Performance/control parameters-Airspeed-Not attained/maintained - C
Personnel issues-Action/decision-Action-Incorrect action performance-Pilot - C
Personnel issues-Task performance-Use of equip/info-Aircraft control-Pilot - C
Environmental issues-Conditions/weather/phenomena-Ceiling/visibility/precip-Low ceiling-Effect on operation
Environmental issues-Conditions/weather/phenomena-Ceiling/visibility/precip-Below approach minima-Decision related to condition - F

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	46
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine Land	Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Instructor Rating(s):	None
Flight Time:	(Estimated) 1300 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	BEECH	Registration:	N88MN
Model/Series:	A36	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Operator:	On file	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None	Engine Model/Series:	IO-520-BB mod
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	CVX, 669 ft msl	Weather Information Source:	Weather Observation Facility
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 200 ft agl	Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	9 knots / 15 knots, 260°
Temperature:	11° C	Visibility	2 Miles
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Fort Wayne, IN (SMD)	Destination:	Charlevoix, MI (CVX)

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 Fatal, 1 Serious	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Latitude, Longitude:	45.304722, -85.275278 (est)		

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Aaron M Sauer	Adopted Date:	04/20/2012
Investigation Docket:	http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=80888		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.