



# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

---

<b>Location:</b>	San Marcos, TX	<b>Accident Number:</b>	CEN12LA229
<b>Date &amp; Time:</b>	04/03/2012, 1930 CDT	<b>Registration:</b>	N1162X
<b>Aircraft:</b>	PIPER PA-34-200T	<b>Aircraft Damage:</b>	Substantial
<b>Defining Event:</b>	Collision during takeoff/land	<b>Injuries:</b>	1 None
<b>Flight Conducted Under:</b>	Part 91: General Aviation - Positioning		

---

## Analysis

The pilot called the Flight Service Station (FSS) before departing on a cross-country flight to ask if there were any restrictions along his flight route that he needed to be aware of; none were mentioned. Upon arrival at his destination about dusk, the pilot listened to the Automated Terminal Information Service (ATIS); the control tower was closed at the time. The pilot then landed the airplane on runway 8, and during the landing roll, the airplane struck construction barriers on the runway, which resulted in the main landing gear shearing off and substantial damage to the left wing. The ATIS recording did not include information about runway 8 being closed.

A March 21, 2012, NOTAM was in effect and stated that runway 8/26 was closed due to construction; this information was not provided or requested during the FSS briefing. The Airman's Information Manual states that an FSS is required to advise pilots of pertinent NOTAMs if a standard briefing is requested. It further states that pilot's should remind the briefer to advise of NOTAMs if the information is not received in the brief. It is ultimately the pilot's responsibility to ensure that he is familiar with all relevant NOTAMs. Further, FAA Order JO7210.3X states, in part, that facilities with runway construction must ensure ATIS message content is complete, accurate, and contains the proper information related to runway closures.

The pilot stated postaccident that reflective ribbons and directional flashing lights, could have helped him see the barrier. He also stated that he flew into the same airport about a week after the accident and noted that the runway closure was included on the ATIS recording.

## Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to ensure that he was aware of the NOTAM describing the runway closure, which resulted in a landing on the closed runway and subsequent collision with a barrier. Contributing to the accident was the failure of air traffic control personnel to include the runway closure information on the recorded ATIS information, which the pilot had listened to

prior to landing.

## Findings

<b>Personnel issues</b>	Forgotten action/omission - Pilot (Cause) Flight planning/navigation - Pilot (Cause)
<b>Organizational issues</b>	Support/Oversight/Monitoring - ATC (Factor)

## Factual Information

On April 3, 2012, approximately 1920 central daylight time, a Piper PA-34-200T, N1162X, registered to Southwest Texas Rain Enhancement Association of Carrizo Springs, Texas, sustained substantial damage when it collided with construction barriers upon landing on closed runway 08 at the San Marcos Municipal Airport (HYI), San Marcos, Texas. The commercial pilot, who was the sole occupant, was not injured. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and a flight plan was not filed for the positioning flight being operated under the provision of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. The flight originated at 1800 from Carrizo Springs, Texas, and San Marcos was its destination.

According to FAA records, the pilot called Fort Worth Flight Service Station (FSS) at 1700 before departure from Carrizo Springs to ask if any Temporary Flight Restrictions (TFRs) were in effect between Carrizo Springs and San Marcos. After an uneventful flight, he landed the airplane on runway 08 at San Marcos. During the landing roll, the airplane struck construction barriers resulting in sheared main landing gear and substantial damage to the left wing.

The San Marcos control tower had closed at 1900. A Notice to Airman (NOTAM) was published and in effect since March 21, 2012, stipulating that runway 08/26 was closed due to construction.

The pilot reported that he had called the Fort Worth FSS prior to the flight and asked for TFR's along the route and asked the briefer if "there was anything else that [he] needed to be aware of." The briefer did not mention the NOTAM that was in effect for the runway 08 closure, nor did the pilot specifically ask about NOTAMs. He stated that upon arrival to San Marcos, about dusk, he listened to the Automated terminal Information Service (ATIS). He said that the ATIS recording did not include the closure of runway 08. He planned to land the airplane a bit long on the 6,600 foot runway to limit taxi time. During the landing roll, he was not able to avoid the barricade.

Chapter 5, paragraph d., of the Airman's Information Manual, states in part that Flight Service stations are required to advise pilots of pertinent NOTAMs if a standard briefing is requested. It also states that pilot's should remind the briefer to advise of NOTAMs if the information was not received in the brief.

Chapter 10, Section 4, paragraph d., of FAA Order JO7210.3X, dated February 9, 2012, states in part that facilities with runway construction must ensure ATIS message content is complete, accurate, and contains the proper information related to runway closures.

On the submitted NTSB Form 6120, Recommendation Section, the pilot stated that reflective ribbons, directional flashing lights, could have helped him see the barrier. He also stated that the accident would have been avoided if the runway closure information was included in the ATIS. He said that he flew into San Marcos about a week after the accident, April 24, and noted that the runway closure was included on the ATIS recording. The pilot offered that had the FSS briefer mentioned the NOTAM and/or if the NOTAM was included in the ATIS recording, the accident would not have occurred.

## History of Flight

Landing	Collision during takeoff/land (Defining event)
---------	--

## Pilot Information

Certificate:	Commercial	Age:	57, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt, Shoulder harness
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	06/10/2011
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	10/18/2010
Flight Time:	2618 hours (Total, all aircraft), 567 hours (Total, this make and model), 2683 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 13 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

## Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Manufacturer:	PIPER	Registration:	N1162X
Model/Series:	PA-34-200T	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Restricted; Normal	Serial Number:	34-7570225
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	6
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	04/04/2011, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2441 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TSIO-360 SER
Registered Owner:	SOUTHWEST TEXAS RAIN ENHANCEMENT ASSOC	Rated Power:	225 hp
Operator:	SOUTHWEST TEXAS RAIN ENHANCEMENT ASSOC	Air Carrier Operating Certificate:	None

## Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Observation Facility, Elevation:	HYI, 597 ft msl	Observation Time:	1917 CDT
Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles	Condition of Light:	Day
Direction from Accident Site:	0°	Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Temperature/Dew Point:	26° C / 17° C
Lowest Ceiling:	None	Visibility	10 Miles
Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	4 knots, 340°	Visibility (RVR):	
Altimeter Setting:	29.73 inches Hg	Visibility (RVV):	
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	Carrizo Springs, TX (CZT)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	San Marcos, TX (HYI)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1830 CDT	Type of Airspace:	Class C

## Airport Information

Airport:	San Marcos Municipal Airport (HYI)	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:		Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	08	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Straight-in

## Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None		

## Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Alexander Lemishko	Adopted Date:	08/13/2013
Additional Participating Persons:	Robert J O'Keefe; FAA FSDO San Antonio; San Antonio, TX		
Publish Date:	08/13/2013		
Investigation Docket:	<a href="http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=83306">http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=83306</a>		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.