



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	La Grande, OR	Accident Number:	WPR13CA261
Date & Time:	06/01/2013, 1640 PDT	Registration:	N650VX
Aircraft:	BEECH A23-24	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Aerodynamic stall/spin	Injuries:	3 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The pilot reported that while flying with a certified flight instructor (CFI) for his biannual review, they were simulating an engine failure over the airport with the intent to land on the runway. After spiraling to traffic pattern altitude, the pilot entered a downwind leg for the runway. The pilot turned towards the runway and inadvertently stalled the airplane about 200 feet above the ground. The CFI took over the flight controls; the airplane struck the ground hard, broke off the right main landing gear, and bounced back into the air. The CFI climbed to a safe altitude and circled above the airport before conducting an uneventful landing onto the grass next to the runway. During the accident sequence, the right wing sustained substantial damage. The pilot reported no mechanical failures or malfunctions with the airframe or engine that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The pilot's failure to maintain airplane control and the flight instructors failure to monitor the pilot during a simulated emergency landing.

Findings

Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot (Cause) Monitoring other person - Instructor/check pilot (Cause)
-------------------------	--

Factual Information

History of Flight

Approach-IFR final approach	Aerodynamic stall/spin (Defining event)
Approach-VFR pattern final	Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	62, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	04/10/2013
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	06/01/2013
Flight Time:	544 hours (Total, all aircraft), 194 hours (Total, this make and model), 480 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 5 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Flight Instructor Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	76, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Right
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	Yes
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Single-engine; Instrument Airplane	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 2 With Waivers/Limitations	Last Medical Exam:	05/15/2012
Occupational Pilot:	Yes	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	09/03/2012
Flight Time:	5524 hours (Total, all aircraft), 95 hours (Total, this make and model), 5145 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 27 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 11 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 2 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Manufacturer:	BEECH	Registration:	N650VX
Model/Series:	A23-24	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	MA-194
Landing Gear Type:	Tricycle	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	08/28/2012, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2550 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	11 Hours	Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2733 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360 SER
Registered Owner:	HUNT RUSSEL AND ANITA	Rated Power:	180 hp
Operator:	HUNT RUSSEL AND ANITA	Air Carrier Operating Certificate:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Observation Facility, Elevation:	LGD, 2717 ft msl	Observation Time:	1635 PDT
Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles	Condition of Light:	Day
Direction from Accident Site:		Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Clear	Temperature/Dew Point:	23°C / 6°C
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 12000 ft agl	Visibility	10 Miles
Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	3 knots, 340°	Visibility (RVR):	
Altimeter Setting:	30.02 inches Hg	Visibility (RVV):	
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	La Grande, OR (LGD)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	La Grande, OR (GLD)	Type of Clearance:	None
Departure Time:	1440 PDT	Type of Airspace:	

Airport Information

Airport:	La Grande/Union County Airport (LGD)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	2717 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	34	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	3876 ft / 60 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop; Traffic Pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	2 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	3 None		

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Samantha A Link	Adopted Date:	09/12/2013
Additional Participating Persons:	Kenneth G Hawkins; Federal Aviation Administration; Boise, ID		
Publish Date:	09/12/2013		
Note:	This accident report documents the factual circumstances of this accident as described to the NTSB.		
Investigation Docket:	http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=87086		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.