



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	Pontiac, MI	Accident Number:	CEN17LA070
Date & Time:	12/23/2016, 1618 EST	Registration:	N1337H
Aircraft:	AERONCA 15AC	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:	Sys/Comp malf/fail (non-power)	Injuries:	1 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The private pilot was concluding a local flight in the tailwheel-equipped airplane. After numerous uneventful touch-and-go landings, the pilot attempted a full-stop landing when the airplane suddenly swerved to the left shortly after touchdown. The pilot attempted to regain directional control by applying right rudder and increasing engine power for an aborted landing; however, the airplane swerved to the right and collided with a snowbank next to the runway. The airplane sustained substantial damage to both main wing spars and the rudder.

A postaccident examination revealed that the left wheel brake torque plate had separated from the landing gear axle endplate, which allowed the brake assembly to rotate with the brake disk that was attached to the wheel. The airplane had been modified with Cleveland wheels and brakes through a supplemental type certificate (STC). However, additional examination of the brake torque plates revealed that they had not been installed in accordance with the STC installation instructions. Specifically, the torque plates were not modified with two 0.25-inch holes that were required to ensure proper alignment with the landing gear axle endplate, and improperly sized bushings had been used during the installation. The improper torque plate installation allowed for movement of the torque plate and unintended transverse loading of the anchor bolts, which resulted in the fracture of the anchor bolts that secured the left brake torque plate to the axle endplate. The failure of the left brake likely caused the loss of directional control during landing.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The improper installation of the left wheel brake torque plate by maintenance personnel, which resulted in the separation of the torque plate from the axle endplate and a loss of directional control during landing.

Findings

Aircraft	Brake - Incorrect service/maintenance (Cause) Brake - Failure (Cause) Directional control - Attain/maintain not possible (Cause)
Personnel issues	Modification/alteration - Maintenance personnel (Cause) Installation - Maintenance personnel (Cause) Aircraft control - Pilot (Cause)
Environmental issues	Snow/ice - Contributed to outcome

Factual Information

On December 23, 2016, about 1618 eastern standard time, an Aeronca model 15AC airplane, N1337H, collided with a snowbank and nosed over while landing at Oakland County International Airport (PTK), Pontiac, Michigan. The private pilot was not injured, and the airplane sustained substantial damage. The airplane was registered to Samcran LLC and operated under the provisions of Title 14 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 91 without a flight plan. Day visual meteorological conditions prevailed for the local flight that departed PTK about 1500.

The pilot reported that the purpose of the flight was to practice landings in the tailwheel-equipped airplane. After departure, he remained in the airport traffic pattern and completed 14 uneventful touch-and-go landings before deciding to conclude the flight with a full stop landing on runway 27R. He reported that he made an uneventful full stall (three point) landing on the runway centerline. However, shortly after touchdown, the airplane suddenly swerved to the left. He attempted to regain directional control with an application of right rudder and increased engine power for an aborted landing. The airplane then swerved to the right as he simultaneously applied forward stick pressure to get the tail airborne. The airplane continued to swerve right until it collided with a 3 ft high snowbank located alongside the runway. The airplane then nosed over and came to rest in the snow-covered area located off the right side of the runway. The pilot was able to exit the airplane uninjured after releasing his lap belt.

The pilot had accumulated 205 hours in the airplane since he purchased it in May 2015. The pilot noted that most of his flight experience in the airplane, 172.9 hours, had been flown with the airplane equipped with landing floats instead of a conventional (tailwheel) landing gear. He had logged 32.1 hours of tailwheel time, all of which were flown in the accident airplane. The pilot received his tailwheel endorsement on March 11, 2016.

A postaccident examination by a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) airworthiness inspector revealed substantial damage to both main wing spars and the rudder. The FAA inspector reported that the four 0.25 inch anchor bolts used to attach the left brake torque plate to its respective landing gear axle endplate had sheared. The unrestrained torque plate allowed the brake assembly to rotate with the brake disk that was attached to the wheel. With the forward rotation, the brake line was pulled around the gear leg until the 90° aluminum fitting that connected the brake line to the caliper assembly sheared. The tire inner sidewall exhibited a gash that partially exposed the inner tube. The inner tube did not rupture but was partially protruding from the gash in the tire sidewall. The sheared anchor bolts had worn a groove on the inboard surface of the left brake disk.

According to maintenance documentation, on January 27, 2016, the airplane had been modified through the implementation of STC No. SA1114NW with Cleveland 8.00 x 6.00 main wheels, tires, and 6 inch external, single cylinder, dual piston brake assemblies. The landing floats were reinstalled on an unknown date during 2016. On December 17, 2016, the landing floats were removed, and the main landing gear and wheels were reinstalled to convert the airplane back into a conventional gear land airplane. The accident occurred during the second flight after the airplane was reequipped with the conventional landing gear.

The installation instructions for STC No. SA1114NW specified that the stock Cleveland brake torque plates be modified per the accompanying installation drawing No. 1200-4 and to use 0.375 inch outside diameter (OD) to 0.25 inch inside diameter (ID) bushings. Installation drawing No. 1200-4 specified that each torque plate required two 0.25 inch holes to be marked and drilled to ensure proper alignment with their respective landing gear axle endplate. Each torque plate was then attached to its respective landing gear axle endplate with four 0.25 inch anchor bolts and washers. The two 0.25 inch holes drilled in each torque plate did not require bushings when installed with a 0.25 inch anchor bolt; however, the remaining two 0.375 inch holes used to attach each torque plate required 0.375 inch OD to 0.25 inch ID bushings to properly support the 0.25 inch anchor bolts.

Further examination of the airplane revealed that both torque plates were not modified and installed in accordance with the STC No. SA1114NW installation instructions. Specifically, the supplied brake torque plates were not modified with the two additional 0.25 inch holes to ensure proper alignment with the landing gear axle endplate. Additionally, both torque plates were installed with improperly sized bushings in multiple holes. The left torque plate, which had separated from the left landing gear axle endplate, had two bushing remaining; one bushing had the correct 0.25 inch ID, the other bushing had a larger 0.3125 inch ID. The right torque plate, which remained attached to the right landing gear axle endplate, was incorrectly installed with four 0.3125 inch ID bushings.

History of Flight

Prior to flight	Aircraft maintenance event
Landing-landing roll	Sys/Comp malf/fail (non-power) (Defining event) Loss of control on ground Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT) Nose over/nose down

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	53, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine Land; Single-engine Sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	None	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With Waivers/Limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	10/07/2016
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	10/30/2016
Flight Time:	342 hours (Total, all aircraft), 205 hours (Total, this make and model), 253 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 49 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 16 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	AERONCA	Registration:	N1337H
Model/Series:	15AC	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1949	Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	15AC-377
Landing Gear Type:	Tailwheel	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	04/14/2016, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2100 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	4380 Hours as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	Continental
ELT:	C126 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	C-145-2
Registered Owner:	On file	Rated Power:	145 hp
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	PTK, 981 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	0 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1553 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	5 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Broken / 8000 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	6 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	None / None
Wind Direction:	190°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	N/A / N/A
Altimeter Setting:	30.18 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	1°C / -2°C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	Moderate - Haze		
Departure Point:	Pontiac, MI (PTK)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Pontiac, MI (PTK)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	1500 EST	Type of Airspace:	Class D

Airport Information

Airport:	Oakland County International A (PTK)	Runway Surface Type:	Asphalt
Airport Elevation:	981 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Dry
Runway Used:	27R	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	5676 ft / 100 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop; Traffic Pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 None	Latitude, Longitude:	42.665556, -83.420556 (est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Andrew T Fox	Report Date:	04/20/2020
Additional Participating Persons:	Richard D Anderson; Federal Aviation Administration, East Michigan; Belleville, MI Ron Stonewall; Federal Aviation Administration, East Michigan; Belleville, MI		
Publish Date:	04/20/2020		
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.		
Investigation Docket:	http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=94570		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).