



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	Naples, ME	Accident Number:	ERA17LA252
Date & Time:	07/16/2017, 1515 EDT	Registration:	N736NK
Aircraft:	CESSNA R172	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Defining Event:		Injuries:	2 None
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 91: General Aviation - Personal		

Analysis

The private pilot was conducting a personal, cross-country flight and was attempting to land on a choppy lake with heavy boat traffic. A witness stated that the airplane looked high and fast during its descent before touching down, and a review of a video of the accident sequence revealed rapid, abrupt rolling of the wings just before water contact. At touchdown, the airplane bounced and then rotated back and forth about the roll axis, alternately contacting the water with the left and right pontoons. The roll oscillations increased in magnitude until the right pontoon and right wingtip dragged the water, which brought the airplane to an abrupt stop with the right wingtip submerged. The right wing and horizontal stabilizer sustained substantial damage.

Postaccident examination of the wreckage revealed no evidence of any preaccident mechanical malfunctions or failures that would have precluded normal operation.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be:

The pilot's failure to maintain airplane control during landing.

Findings

Aircraft	Performance/control parameters - Not attained/maintained (Cause)
Personnel issues	Aircraft control - Pilot (Cause)

Factual Information

On July 16, 2017, about 1515 eastern daylight time, a Cessna R172K, N736NK, was substantially damaged during landing at Brandy Pond Seaplane Base (5ME), Naples, Maine. The private pilot and passenger were not injured. The personal flight was conducted under the provisions of 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and no flight plan was filed for the flight that departed Biddeford Municipal Airport (B19), Biddeford, Maine.

The pilot reported to local police that when the airplane landed it "bounced" and that he was "not entirely sure what happened" and felt that maybe one of the wings went into the water. In a statement provided to a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector, the pilot reported, "Upon water landing touchdown and after an otherwise normal circling approach the aircraft yaw and roll were uncontrollable. The aircraft rolled right and came to a stop with at least part of the right wing submerged."

Multiple witnesses reported the water was "choppy" and "very busy" with boating activity. The landing was recorded by a boater on Brandy Pond at the time of the accident and posted on a commercial website. Examination of the video revealed rapid, abrupt rolling of the wings at a very low altitude just prior to water contact. At touchdown, the airplane bounced and then rotated back and forth about the roll axis, alternately contacting the water with the left and right pontoons. The roll oscillations increased in magnitude until the right pontoon and right wing tip dragged the water, which brought the airplane to an abrupt stop with the right wingtip submerged.

One witness stated the water was rough and he thought the airplane looked high on its approach and was not landing into the wind. He stated the airplane was fast and did not decrease power until just before touchdown.

Examination of the airplane by the FAA inspector revealed that the right wing and right horizontal stabilizer were substantially damaged. Flight control continuity was confirmed to all flight control surfaces. Movement of the elevator was restricted due to impact damage.

The four-seat, high wing, amphibious airplane, was powered by a Continental IO-360, 210 horsepower engine.

The pilot held a private pilot certificate with ratings for airplane single-engine land, and airplane single-engine sea. He reported 650 hours of total flight experience on his most recent application for an FAA third-class medical certificate, which was issued on February 28, 2017.

The closest weather reporting facility was Auburn/Lewiston Municipal Airport (LEW), Auburn, Maine, about 14 miles east of the accident site. At 1656, weather included wind from 170° at 12 knots; clear skies; visibility 10 statute miles; temperature, 28° C; dew point, 18° C; and an altimeter setting 29.91 inches of mercury.

History of Flight

Landing	Loss of control in flight Dragged wing/rotor/float/other
---------	---

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Private	Age:	53, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Single-engine Land; Single-engine Sea	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	None	Toxicology Performed:	No
Medical Certification:	Class 3 With Waivers/Limitations	Last FAA Medical Exam:	02/28/2017
Occupational Pilot:	No	Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	07/16/2017
Flight Time:	650 hours (Total, all aircraft), 620 hours (Total, this make and model), 650 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 20 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 8 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	CESSNA	Registration:	N736NK
Model/Series:	R172 K	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:	1977	Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	R1722656
Landing Gear Type:	Amphibian	Seats:	4
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	04/03/2017, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	2550 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:		Engines:	1 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	2271 Hours as of last inspection	Engine Manufacturer:	CONT MOTOR
ELT:	C91 installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	IO-360 SER
Registered Owner:	MAINE AIR PHYSICIAN SERVICES LLC	Rated Power:	210 hp
Operator:	On file	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	None

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Visual Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	KLEW, 288 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	14 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	1656 EDT	Direction from Accident Site:	66°
Lowest Cloud Condition:		Visibility	10 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:		Visibility (RVR):	
Wind Speed/Gusts:	10 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/ None
Wind Direction:	170°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/ N/A
Altimeter Setting:	29.91 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	28° C / 18° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:	No Obscuration; No Precipitation		
Departure Point:	BIDDEFORD, ME (B19)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	None
Destination:	Naples, ME (5ME)	Type of Clearance:	VFR
Departure Time:	1430 EDT	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	BRANDY POND (5ME)	Runway Surface Type:	Water
Airport Elevation:	268 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	Water--choppy
Runway Used:	35W	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:	7200 ft / 600 ft	VFR Approach/Landing:	Full Stop; Traffic Pattern

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	1 None	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	2 None	Latitude, Longitude:	43.953889, -70.587500 (est)

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Millicent M Hill	Report Date:	04/20/2020
Additional Participating Persons:	Daniel Kelman; FAA/FSDO; Portland, ME		
Publish Date:	04/20/2020		
Note:	The NTSB did not travel to the scene of this accident.		
Investigation Docket:	http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/search/dockList.cfm?mKey=95619		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).